Qualitative study of scale-up – ETS case study

Catalysing scale-up – decision making

• Could you talk us through the decision making to scale-up ETS within Adamawa?
  o Explore a) the decision for Comic Relief to fund ETS in Adamawa; b) getting agreement/support to work in Adamawa

• What/when were the most critical moments/events in the process?

• Who were the critical actors - organisations and individuals in the process?
  o E.g. Federal/state government; Comic Relief and other donors/development partners; civil society organisations; traditional rulers; professional associations incl. NURWT
  o Which actors supported the decision? Was there any resistance – whom? How?

• What actions did did Transaid take to catalyse the decision to scale-up? Explore for example:
  o Effective advocacy:
    o Presenting evidence
      ▪ Type of evidence, strength/relevance of evidence
      ▪ How evidence was communicated
    o Invoking key actors as champions and supportive partners
      ▪ Gates foundation role in catalysing scale-up
      ▪ Development partners
      ▪ CSOs and traditional leaders
  o Strong coordination
    ▪ Alignment with government priorities, policies, programmes, targets
    ▪ Working closely with /involving/engaging government
    ▪ Harmonising with development partners/ donors and implementers
  o Effective planning:
    o Was scale-up hardwired into (planned/resourced) the grant for evolved later?
    o What resources/capacities did Transaid have to catalyse scale-up / (human resources, reputation, resources, flexibility...)?
  o Developing a scalable innovation:
    o What was it about the ETS innovation that made it scalable (e.g. cheap, simple, adaptable)?
    o What steps were taken to ensure the innovation would be scalable/suitable for scale-up? Explore e.g. – who was involved in the design; steps to evaluate and reflect etc
  o Timing
    o Was timing an issue in catalysing the decision to scale-up?
    o Did the grantee push hard for the decision or was more cautious?
Enabling implementation at scale

Could you talk about the experience of implementing/rolling out ETS within Adamawa?

- What are the major activities/steps required to scale-up into Adamawa?
- What roles do Transaid and SFH having in implementing at scale?
- What roles do other actors have in implementing ETS in Adamawa/how do Transaid and SFH work with other actors? E.g.
  - NURWT
  - State government
  - Healthcare providers

Steps to encourage drivers to enrol on programme

Effective and sustainable scale-up

- Have steps been taken to make ETS high quality/effective at scale?
- Have steps been taken to make ETS sustainable in the longer term - e.g. as part of government programmes?
  - What is Transaid's role – what is it doing? E.g. strengthening government capacity; technical assistance?
  - What are the main issues or challenges? E.g. Government capacity, donor dependence

- How does the ETS Adamawa programme fit in with wider efforts to scale up across other Nigerian states?

Barriers and enablers

- Are there barriers/challenges to scaling ETS within Adamawa? What were the main enabling factors? What are they? Explore for example:
  - Policy making/economic/government priorities/government rules and procedures
  - Issues of donor coordination
  - Health systems strengths and weaknesses - Infrastructure; human resources; commodity supply; governance (including management, accountability); information systems; financing
  - Sociocultural issues – including gender relations
  - Other operating constraints – including driver incentives, driver availability etc
  - Security issues in NE states

- Do different geographic areas of Adamawa have different barriers and enablers? Is Adamawa different to Gombe and other Nigerian states? How?

- Have these barriers been overcome? How?
Key messages for other grantees

- What are the **most important steps** externally funded grantees can take for catalysing scale-up of their innovations?
  - Explore advocacy, planning, scalable innovations, timing.
  - Explore enabling implementation at scale

- Is there a particular **formula** (set of steps) for catalysing scale up or quite a lot of luck?
- Is it about **planning** in advance or flexibility / adapting to change?
- Is it about **individuals/personalities** or organisations?

Key messages for donors and government

- What are the main messages for the **Foundation and other donors** based on the ETS experience in Nigeria?
  - What should the foundation do to support grantees to catalyse scale-up? E.g.
    - Direct catalysing effects by foundation – Program Officers and co-Chairs
    - Hardwiring scale-up into grants (scale-up = costed project deliverable)
    - Longer term grants?
    - Promoting harmonisation and alignment – including information sharing.

- What are the main messages for **Nigeria federal/ state governments** – what should government do to maximise the value of externally funded innovations such as ETS?