### SUSTAINABILITY DOMAIN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>ACTIONS</th>
<th>CONTEXT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In which ways has the innovation been sustained?</td>
<td>What actions are taken to achieve sustainability? Which actors are performing these actions? Have actions been effective?</td>
<td>Enabling contextual factors? Undermining contextual factors?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 2 | Overall sustainability |
| 3 | Decision making to scale-up and sustain innovation |
| 4 | Innovation design |
| 5 | Financial & political |
| 6 | Institutionalisation |
| 7 | Organisation capacity |
| 8 | Routinisation |
| 9 | Social sustainability |
| 10 | Aid effectiveness |

#### 1. Overview of VHW implementation

**DESCRIPTION**

Has implementation of the village health worker scheme gone according to plan? (in terms of recruitment, training, deployment, supervision, tasks covered, incentive scheme, monitoring)

- What has been particularly **effective**?
- Have there been any **challenges**, and if so what?

**ACTIONS**

Did the scheme have to be **adapted or changed** in any way? If yes, how were any challenges overcome?

- **Who** was involved in making those changes?
- Were they only implemented in one or two wards, or across all 57?

How might those variations be accommodated when the scheme is scaled to the rest of the Gombe State?
2. Overall sustainability of the VHW scheme

DESCRIPTION
Is the VHW scheme sustainable? In what ways? How long is it expected to be sustained?

ACTIONS
What key actions have fostered innovation sustainability?
Which actors performed/perform those actions?
Have these actions been effective?
How was the decision made to sustain the innovation?
What were the key factors influencing the decision to sustain the innovation? [probe – was evidence of cost/effectiveness a part of the decision making?]
Who were the main actors influencing the decision?

CONTEXT
What are the main factors in the northeast Nigerian context enabling and undermining innovation sustainability?
Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?

3. Decision making

How was the decision made to adopt and sustain the innovation at scale?
Who were the main actors influencing the decision? [Probe – individuals and organisations]
What were the main factors influencing the decision? [probe – generation and presentation of evidence; government involvement in project; effective policy advocacy; support from champions and other organisations; scale-up was integrated within project design]
Did the country context influence the decision to adopt and sustain the innovation at scale? [probe – health and other development priorities; governance – how governments make policy decisions; influence of development agencies, civil society and other policy actors]
4. Innovation - design for sustainability

DESCRIPTION

Is the innovation designed to be sustainable? In what ways? [probe – use table?]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant &amp; important</th>
<th>Addresses important and/or visible health problems/needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effective &amp; advantageous</td>
<td>Impacts positively on communities’ health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Has a comparative advantage over other innovations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observable benefits</td>
<td>Benefits and health impacts are visible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Benefits are easily demonstrated through evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acceptable to health workers &amp; communities</td>
<td>Culturally acceptable to sociocultural norms, religions, language, health beliefs and practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appropriately branded using ideas and language meaningful to users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seen as being owned by communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Works with existing community structures and actors including village committees and traditional birth attendants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Benefits and incentivises health workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Does not burden health workers by adding to their workload or making them more accountable for failure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple &amp; low cost</td>
<td>Simple/convenient to use and easily understood by health workers and communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low cost to implement at scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low human resource inputs required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Places no/minimal cost burden on user communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aligned &amp; harmonised</td>
<td>Builds on and aligns with existing government health systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Addresses needs/fills gaps in government health programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coordinates with other donor programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptable</td>
<td>Adaptable to different geographical, socioeconomic and cultural contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adaptable to different health systems contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable</td>
<td>Avoids/has low recurrent costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Includes local income generating schemes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACTIONS

What actions were/are being taken to help ensure the innovation is designed to be sustainable?

Was evidence generated to support decision making? [probe – impacts evidence; operational evidence; cost evidence; other]

Which actors performed/perform those actions?

Have these actions been effective? How?

CONTEXT

Are there contextual factors making it more or less difficult to design the innovation for sustainability?

Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?
5. Financial and political sustainability

DESCRIPTION
What financing model has been/will be adopted to support the continuation of the innovation? [probe – government budgets; private sector investment; donor support; local income generation]
- Which actors are providing sustainable financing?
- What are the strengths and limitations of the model?
- Is government able to financially sustain the innovation without donor support?
- Is there sustainable political support for longer-term financing for the innovation?
- Which actors support the sustainability of the innovation?

ACTIONS
What actions enabled/are enabling political support and financial sustainability of the innovation to be achieved?
- Which actors performed/perform those actions?
- Have these actions been effective?

CONTEXT
Are there adequate and predictable financial resources in the country context?
- Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?

6. Institutionalisation

DESCRIPTION
Has the innovation been embedded in country institutions – health policies; health systems; health services? [probe – legal, regulatory, budgetary frameworks; routine information systems; logistics and supply chains; human resources systems, monitoring]

ACTIONS
What actions enabled/are enabling the innovation to be embedded within country institutions?
- Which actors performed/perform those actions?
- Have these actions been effective?
CONTEXT
Are country institutions supportive or undermining of the introduction of the innovation? Which aspects? How? [probe – legal, regulatory, budgetary frameworks; routine information systems; logistics and supply chains; human resources systems]

Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?

7. Organisational capacity / programmatic sustainability

CONTEXT
Does the health system have sufficient capacity to sustain the innovation? [probe – governance; financial systems; logistics and supply chains; information systems; human resources]
Are there weaknesses in the health system than make it difficult to sustain the innovation?

Were actions taken/will actions be taken to overcome any weaknesses?

ACTIONS
Have actions been taken/will actions be taken to strengthen aspects of the health system to enable the innovation to be sustained?

Which actors performed/perform those actions?
Have these actions been effective? How?

8. Routinisation in health worker practices

DESCRIPTION
Have VHWs been adopted as part of routine practices within the health system?

What incentivised HWs to adopt the innovation?

What incentivises HWs to continue to use the innovation within their routine practices? [probe - supervision, support and training updates; low effort to learn, use and remember; ‘fun’ and ‘pleasurable’ to use; gives HW a sense of agency and control; helps HW perform their roles; increasing HW status and ability to persuade others; improves HW pride and awareness of their effective performance]

ACTIONS
What actions have been taken/will be taken to encourage health workers to use the innovation within their routine practices?

Which actors performed/perform those actions?
Have these actions been effective? How?
CONTEXT
Are there contextual factors enabling or undermining health workers adopting the innovation within their routine practices? [probe – economic factors; geographical factors; sociocultural factors influencing HW behaviour]

Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?

9. Social sustainability

DESCRIPTION
Is there longer term acceptance of and demand for the innovation from beneficiary communities?
Are community structures and leaders supportive of the innovation?
Is there community ownership of the innovation?

ACTIONS
Have actions been taken/will actions be taken to foster acceptance, demand and ownership from beneficiary communities and support from community structures and leaders?

Which actors performed/perform those actions? [probe – actions to involve communities/community structures and leaders in designing and implementing the innovation?]

Have these actions been effective? How?

CONTEXT
Does the sociocultural context enable or undermine communities’ acceptance of and demand for the innovation?

Were actions taken to overcome any barriers?

10. Aid effectiveness – behaviour of donors, government and implementers

How should donors behave (what approaches should they take) to foster scale-up and sustainability of externally funded innovations?

Probe –

Coordination – harmonisation and alignment and embracing country coordination mechanisms
Embracing country ownership including using existing country systems
Predictability of donor funding
Transparency and accountability
How should governments behave (what approaches should they take) to foster scale-up and sustainability of externally funded innovations?

Probe –

  - Coordination – promoting harmonisation and alignment among donors and implementers and government leadership of country coordination mechanisms
  - Civil society participation and engagement
  - Transparency and accountability

How should implementers behave (what approaches should they take) to foster scale-up and sustainability of externally funded innovations?

Probe –

  - Coordination – harmonisation and alignment and embracing country coordination mechanisms
  - Embracing country ownership including using existing country systems
  - Transparency and accountability